

Transcript of 9:00 EAT (East Africa Time) Q&A for “Killing, Capture, and Trade” Broadcast

**Note: transcript has been edited to focus on commentary and discussion.*

Kylie I would suggest that it is the demand side that needs to change.

KI Absolutely, Kylie.

Steve U #Kylie - agree totally - the trick is to find strategies that improve education and alter lifestyles, to reduce demand. Annette's message that we are part of nature is vital.

gary Has the rate of killing apes been increasing, decreasing or remaining at a stable level?

Jess W Morning everyone from the UK. Do organised criminals who trade in nonhuman great apes specialise in type of animal or do they trade in a range of apes and/or trade in other animals too?

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Hi Jess W – it's pretty rare for organised criminals to be specialised on apes in my experience. All the traders we were tracking were trading in all types of animals, clouded leopards, bears, otters - anything and everything.

taza hi I'm taza, is sustainable palm oil really worked?

Steve U #Jess - to add to Karen's comment - crime is crime - often not just restricted to animal trade either.

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics yes - there is a lot of convergence with other illegal trade, timber, people, guns and drugs.

Petro Diamant Yes. Loss of Habitat is increasing.

Jess W Thanks Karen. Do they tend to operate out of one geographical area? Has research been done already on their offending behaviour, routes of trade? Apologies if you've all already been doing this research!

Kylie Or can we say that the greatest threat (driving habitat destruction etc) is consumption by the developed country consumers. How do we address that when so many other industries are focused on making us buy/consume more...?

BHARATHI We are part of Nature-no doubt...We are also a part of a system in which we need money- to create wealth! The rural humans are not an exemption...After educating them we need to find jobs for them too...

KI Agreed Steve U ... altering lifestyles is difficult in the US ... I've seen that it's nearly impossible to educate or dissuade consumers from purchasing products that destroy habitat.

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Hi Jess W - There are a number of different projects that have happened in the past. At Global Eye, we were tracking great ape trade throughout Asia. There are large number of networks that operate through the area. Each network operates slightly differently. Most wildlife brokers throughout indonesia were geographically based, with scouts that go to different forest areas to capture animals, and then they send their animals worldwide from there.

Steve U With education comes skills comes jobs - no matter where you are - agreed it is closely tied to social and political and economic assistance. To be that well-coordinated as a species is certainly a grand challenge! But we must try.

Kylie TRAFFIC is an organisation that works on tracking the illegal wildlife trade.

Dave Consumerism impacts us all. How many of us know whether the Coltan in our phones came from a recycled source, or from a illegal mine in DRC? Very tough.

Charlotte Are there any gaps in research which would benefit our knowledge of this topic? Particularly any studies that are desk based?

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics More is always necessary, and the problem is that intelligence work is labour intensive, and time bound, it can change very rapidly, but getting law enforcement buy-in and action can take months to years.

Steve U With education also comes empathy, and a better understanding that we are all part of the same system.

Hi from Los Angeles! Aren't the people who buy Great Apes as pets wealthy and entitled individuals who don't believe laws apply to them?

Steve U #traffic.org

hollyT From my experience owning an ape in range states isn't just for those with money.

Jess W Thanks Steve, Karen and Kylie.

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Yes, Holly T is correct. Owning pets in country is often by poor villagers who don't really understand that it's not good for them or the Ape, however, overseas buyers definitely fit that bill. They know that they shouldn't be receiving these animals, and it is a status symbol for them to promote themselves often via social media.

Jess W there is mention of online advertising of live animals to purchase - is this on the surface web or dark web? Or both?

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Jess W - Both. it is often on Facebook and Instagram.

Felicity But there is also a demand driven by people in search of status symbol exotic animals

Hi from Los Angeles! Thanks hollyT and Karen, those are helpful insights — distinguishing between pet ownership and consumers overseas vs in range states

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics They don't really need to use the Dark Web as they have been able to operate with impunity on social media platforms, and facebook in particular has made it very easy for illegal traders to continue, with the creation of secret groups that you can't search for.

Steve U #Karen - is there any quantified information that Traffic has gathered on potential nodes for the international trade? What I saw in areas of the Middle East for example seemed pretty unregulated. Money definitely talks - another side of the demand where education may not make a difference at all....

James Wingard Studies into illegal wildlife trade on the dark web have not come up with significant activity.

Jess W Thanks James and Karen. Not surprising that people don't expend the effort if it's so easy to do on social media.

James Wingard Exactly.

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics I'm not sure what information TRAFFIC has gathered most recently - I do not work for TRAFFIC. The work Global Eye completed definitely found Indonesia, KL and Dubai as nodes in the international trade.

Jaqueline B. Ramos What do you think about the human legal rights perspective for great apes and other nonhuman animals? Can this approach also be useful for conservation efforts?

Steve U Thanks Karen

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Yes Jess - Mobile Apps like WhatsApp, Signal, Blackberry BBM, snapchat, instagram are all prolific.

Sinan Sumatra what about zoos that are part of the trade in apes? there are many zoos across Indonesia where legalized zoos purchase orangutan and gibbon babies from traders and are also part of selling animals illicitly. People are still okay with seeing apes in Zoos and behind bars.

Hi from Los Angeles! Jacqueline, I believe there is legal precedent in the US for great apes and dolphins in special cases being granted "personhood"

Good morning from the University of Birmingham, England :) There was a recent TV show in the UK with Ross Kemp where he showed just how easy it was to purchase rhinos, panthers, apes etc on Facebook! It was shocking!

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Hi Sinan Sumatra - yes, this is a big issue. I have been working within CITES working groups for the last 5 years trying to close the loopholes that are allowing this to occur, and trying to raise this as a serious threat that requires Parties attention.

Felicity Good - this is an important issue indeed.

Jaqueline B. Ramos Yes, the cases are for chimps and elephants in poor conditions of captivity. I wonder if this perspective could be applied somehow to the protection of animals in the wild.

Piet Wit In the area where we work (Guinea Bissau), habitat destruction is driven by population growth and immigration. Not industrial developments. Our strategic effort is therefore community based. At the same time we have the impression that the better visibility of Chimpanzees in our area is also linked to the apes losing their fear of people as hunting or chasing them off is simply "not done".

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics There are definitely good zoos that are contributing positively to the conservation of apes, however, these other zoos, which I have called "psuedo zoos" are basically entertainment establishments that have no conservation benefit. I think it is important to make that distinction.

Aliguma Ahabyona, CCFU - Uganda In Uganda, whereas the State has allowed some investors to enter selected protected forests, we can now rely more on Private Forest Owners to restore some forest corridors. I think consistent dialogues with state authorities, investors and communities can help...

Sinan Sumatra How would you address the utter lack of law enforcement and corruption?

Orangutan and gibbon traders are rarely convicted and a lot of them are connected to government officials.

marc Hi Sinan, extremely good point: a group of us are currently analysing the situation in Indonesia and indeed, the lack of prosecution is a very very real issue

Good morning from the University of Birmingham, England :) Is there a problem associated with testing on apes for scientific purposes?

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Sinan Sumatra - this is a key issue, and one of the reasons Global Eye struggled to get any convictions of the very vast networks we had excelled information on.

marc A couple of papers will be published soon with all the results of the orangutan trade over the past 15 years in Indonesia

Jess W Thanks Marc. Will look out for these.

Kylie Human apes eating 'animal' apes - that's revolting.

Sinan Sumatra But what happens when tourism collapses if you put all cards on tourism? Bukit Lawang is a mess now. Also tourism is still commodifying wildlife. Once tourism stops what keeps the animals alive if not intrinsic values and a strong livelihood base that does not depend on tourism?

Aliguma Ahabyona, CCFU - Uganda Dr. Roe, could you kindly share your approach to community involvement - especially on tourism. Various discussions in Uganda on the effectiveness of this in the long run... any reports or a line is welcome. Thanks!

Jess W Interesting point of the pre-recorded session regarding poachers being outsiders and not part of the local community. Karen is that also the case with the scouts you mentioned earlier? Thanks.

Felicity I agree re: tourism is still commodifying wildlife - it is really a fine line and needs to be managed intensively and carefully.

Alex saying hello from Cameroon In the Douala-Edea National Park in Cameroon most of the poachers are outsiders.

Jess W Thanks Alex. This is really helpful to know.

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics No; that wasn't our experience in Orangutan and Gibbon ranges. The scouts were generally from the region, the broker might be from outside the area, but the scouts were recruited from the areas where the animals lived, as they knew the area best.

Dave I think I'd rather commodify apes rather than lose them altogether. Tourism in Rwanda almost certainly turned around fortunes for Mountain Gorillas, the only great apes increasing in numbers.

Kylie True that tourism is commodifying wildlife, but humans are curious and it could be said that most tourism is about commodifying the 'different'. I go to other countries to see the people and the culture, etc. So I'm not sure that ceasing wildlife tourism is a good idea.

hollyT A very forthcoming poacher I once spoke about this issue with was happy with a consistent income thanks to the conservation project he was a part of as a ranger and no longer had to rely on the trader coming into his community requesting the array of species they wanted for market or special request. We asked if a trader still came in would he still poach however he firmly said no due to the animals now being his livelihood to protect to continue his income and communities livelihood living off the land (due to rainforest buffer agriculture). This does not work for all as many are outsiders. So difficult.

Steve U Good points being made here on the webinar - education is NOT to say 'you are doing something bad - change' - it's more about engaging and sharing knowledge between groups on advantages and disadvantages of trade.

Jess W Thanks Karen. Very helpful to know the variation in how this type of criminal behaviour plays out in reality.

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Definitely - a lot of rangers are former poachers.

Sinan Sumatra Dave I agree but what happens when tourism incentives collapse as we are seeing now very clearly? Conservation should not solely depend on outside tourism.

Alex saying hello from Cameroon I agree with you Dave most our government will not see the importance of law enforcement if they don't see something to gain and I think we can start with Tourism before looking for other incentives.

Steve U For example in volume 5 we do explore the disease risks to all apes (including humans) at the human-ape interface.

marc More and more evidence show that long-term research has a very positive impact on ape conservation. Why? Because local people get steady and regular incomes. And this is the key: we need to provide source of incomes to people who share the same habitat with apes.

Kim This concept is called "value-in-social-context, we use it in service marketing and I'm working on applying it to trade research atm - value is determined by each person that consumes it in the moment and is shaped by their own experiences and social background.

Dave Sinan, you are right. Tourism is one of many solutions we need to consider.

Phil B - Rare Wild meat consumption is a prime area for conservation programs that use behavioral science, rather than relying on just information deficit! The field could benefit from a wider lens on human behavior, particularly norm-change as oppose to relying on economics and information.

Steph from Gibbon Conservation Society Hi! Thank you so much for this informative talk. I'm from Gibbon Conservation Society (GCS) in Malaysia. Our main project is the Gibbon Rehabilitation Project (our gibbons are all former victims of the pet trade) We are working to create more awareness about trade and hopefully reduce the demand. We are looking for collaborators to advise/participate in anti-pet trade campaigns in Malaysia. We'd also be honoured to work with anyone who is interested in creating awareness. GCS: <https://www.instagram.com/gibbonconser...>

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics you are right Sinan. Covid 19 has shown very clearly the issue with this. We have to create robust livelihoods for local communities and a love of animals that is tied to them being alive; which is not reliant on tourism. This is the challenge.

Sinan Sumatra Yes Karen that's the long-term challenge. I think with all methods, we should diversify it as much as we can.

Kim Phil B- Rare - agreed. I'm an interdisciplinary researcher working in marketing and wildlife trade, there's so much to be learned from the social and economic sciences.

Dave Karen, true, but the Rwanda experience - during the genocide - when tourism collapsed, showed that local people would still protect the gorillas because they knew of their value.

Aliguma Ahabyona, CCFU - Uganda Along Mountain Rwenzori, a home to about 1,000 chimpanzees, the 'Batangyi' that hold the Chimpanzee as their totem have tried to engage poachers and these have turned to conservationists. I think more engagements with cultural leaders and actors could offer a sustainable solution.

Sinan Sumatra Dave that is indeed good news. I guess after time people also get to love them not solely for the tourism dollar. But when I interviewed former poachers turned guide in Cambodia they said that they just would go back to poaching if tourists stopped coming.

Dave Sinan, we're talking about generational change. Cultural change. Economic change. All these things take time and well-managed tourism is just one thing we should consider.

Sinan Sumatra Totally agreed. We have to learn from lessons learned and apply it carefully together with other strategies.

Dave Sinan ... you are so right.

Sinan Sumatra Is anyone working on discouraging these so called instagram influencers? People from Safari Parks across the US use apes and other wildlife to become famous. They dress them up and do unnatural things with them and they are getting a huge follower base.

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Yes - there are a number of organisations working on that.

Kim I work on research into social media wildlife trade, which includes recommendations for demand reduction posts etc.

hollyT we often see traded species become available by default for zoos. This may be due to confiscation, becoming too big for the owners, relinquished etc. What are your thoughts? This has been a topic with Javan gibbon due to the trade through the middle east

Jess W Sinan, there's also some really disturbing TV programmes on TV platforms for kids where unusual animals are dressed up. Not sending the right message.

Sinan Sumatra What about when rescue centres post content to get attention to funds? Even if there is no human interaction in the content.

Charlotte @sinan, the Primate specialist groups section for human Primate interactions have recently published guidelines on responsible online Primate imagery which touches on that

Sian Waters It's the human-primate interaction that can be problematic.

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics I often post pictures of pet owners who have been attacked by their pets whenever I see a post promoting ape ownership...

Alex saying hello from Cameroon Most primates pets in Cameroon are sold to foreigners or later finish in the kitchen

Felicity <https://human-primate-interactions.org...> Best Practice Guidelines for Responsible Imagery of Non-Human Primates

Estelle PPI Caring in rehab centers of orphaned apes also show that every individuals are import. That not only the wild ones have to be protected but also those in captivity. Rescue centers, sanctuaries are one of the tools that exists to change perception towards great apes.

Join from Liberia, West Africa How do we deal with politicians interference when rangers try to enforce the law?

Estelle PPI These guidelines do recognize that images taken at accredited sanctuaries in natural situation especially with local staff are acceptable. But also with international caregivers wearing signs that these orphans are cared for in a sanctuary (mask wearing, uniforms etc..)

Sian Waters Estelle PPI Context is vital and that is why we recommend that PPE is worn by ALL carers or the context of the photo is very clear.

kjl the last question about pressure companies to stop encroaching primate habitats were not answered?

Sinan Sumatra I wonder why the root cause of the pandemic (wildlife trade and destruction of ecosystems) are not addressed with the same effort as vaccinations and lockdowns...

Luis Lwiro The real problem is when bushmeat is linked to other activities as trafficking

Felicity good question!

Luis Lwiro and when that meat go to more global markets in big cities

Steve U @Sinan - that takes global co-ordination and understanding - humans are not so good at that - yet. Even the disaster response is often unfortunately along geopolitical lines. When thinking about biodiversity or ecosystem loss, that comes back to Annette's original message that we are a

part of nature, and maybe a message of self harm would resonate more. Even COP26 talks about how we much protect nature - there is little there to indicate that we are part of nature and that its protection is in our own self interest. As primates, we do tend to be narcissistic, or at least egocentric...and that links back to the companies question - if there was a reduced demand for extraction, they would not do it so much

Hi from Los Angeles! I'd love to hear about the risk of our human diseases to wild Great Ape populations. I know at the beginning of the COVID-19 pandemic there was a lot of fear that COVID could decimate already CR Great Ape species.

KAPOTEC I do appreciate the discussion, however the killing of apes in my locality especially Kyamajaka village, Muhorro sub county is as a result of attacking human beings. Either side People or apes tend to reiterate. The problem largely is lack of gazate for their sanctuary.

Steve U While you wait for volume 5 :-), there are a growing number of investigations into the issue of spillover risk of human disease to wild great apes. Dr Fabian Leendertz at the RKI is a leader on this, but there are many others investigating pathogen spread from human to apes at the human-wildlife interface in the literature..

Piet Wit thank you very much for this interesting seminar

Karen Winfield - Conservation Analytics Thanks for watching and for your questions.

Jess W Excellent seminar. Thank you for the opportunity to join and chat with you all.

Hi from the Netherlands Many thanks for this great webinar, also lots of interesting comments in the chat - thanks everyone.