

**Transcript of 11:00 EDT (Eastern Daylight Time) Q&A for “Killing, Capture, and Trade”
Broadcast** **Note: transcript has been edited to focus on commentary and discussion.*

1planet Hearing all of this is heartbreaking!

Heather at Arcus Yes, it is sobering. And understanding is key to effective solutions. Does anyone have questions to ask our panelists?

When will Arcus take on the PR challenge of educating the public that WE are great apes? How often is law enforcement in relevant countries ineffective or even corrupt?

John at the Cross Cultural Foundation of Uganda. Happy to listen... How do we move away from the fortress mentality that animated the creation of protected areas, so that local communities have a stake in their sustainability? Is it unsustainable?

Rebecca Sweet Fascinating talks so far.

Ronald Orenstein Question: What is the current status of the dam project threatening the range of the Tapanuli Orangutan?

Marli If we were to remove the outside elements - the richer countries taking advantage of resources for example - how much of a drop would you think we would see in wildlife crime? And as a side note, does wildlife 'tourism' help or hinder the issues faced? Thank you

Ronald Orenstein Wildlife crime is complex and operates across different scales. For example, while trade in rhino horn caters to wealthy overseas buyers, illegal trade in vultures in West Africa has a largely local market.

Annette Roland: to my knowledge the dam project is still planned in the Batang Toro area.

When will Arcus take on the PR challenge of educating the public that WE are great apes? Apologies for cultural insensitivity, but traditional medicine based on magic must be stopped.

Ronald Orenstein Is any action being taken to mitigate the threat to the Tapanuli population?

hello everyone! I want to say it's an honor to be here today! thanks for the opportunity What can we do as individuals in order to help the Apes? it breaks my soul to hear all this and not be able to do more! I donate, I stopped using multinational products such as Nutella, Oreos, and other products. What else can we do??? we need to do something!);

Annette Marli: Wildlife tourism is a dangerous practice that can do much harm, but if very carefully controlled, managed and focused on the objective of conservation, it can be an extremely valuable tool for conservation. However, the financial benefits must flow to communities and the people actually experiencing the down sides of living near the forest.

Ronald Orenstein As for tourism - the collapse of ecotourism in response to the pandemic may have exacerbated poaching in some areas as people relying on tourism have had to find other sources of income.

Boo Maisels WCS In large areas of central Africa, there is nobody to sell a pet to, and the animals are killed for meat (usually to sell, as large chunks of meat raise a lot of money).

Annette Ronald: Yes, there are some really good conservation organizations working in the Tapanuli range, with both Indonesian and foreign organizations working together, and in close collaboration with local people.

Mikki@NYC BAR Very pleased to be listening in with other likeminded people alarmed about the status of apes- so articulate, substantive and on point.

Boo Maisels WCS So for large geographic areas, killing apes for meat is several orders of magnitude more important than killing for the pet trade.

Bonnie @ Thinking Animals United Public Relations is key to changing the minds of the public.

Ronald Orenstein CITES is trying to come to grips with online trading - enforcement is very difficult.

Kasia I understand that there is a great deal of corruption within CITES. Is there any hope that there will be more accountability for this organization to step up and its members be held accountable to uphold the job they have of protecting apes among other endangered animals?

Bonnie @ Thinking Animals United It seems to me that whistleblower laws might be a help. The US laws cover foreign wildlife crimes as well as those in the US.

Taylor What legal obligations do companies have to protect orangutans within their concessions, and how well are such laws enforced in Indonesia? Is enforcement primarily conducted by local or national authorities?

Annette Here is some information on the situation for the Tapanuli orangutan:

<https://news.mongabay.com/2021/01/new-...>

Ronald Orenstein Thanks, Annette for the link.

James Wingard IWT is a complex issue and multiple tools need to be in place. CITES implementation and whistleblower laws need to be part of it. In our research, we've identified as many as 43 different areas of law that can and should play a role.

Annette Taylor: orang-utans are legally protected, so companies do have to protect them. However, this is not enforced adequately.

Ronald Orenstein Corruption gets in the way, especially when powerful interests (eg timber, oil palm) are involved.

Boo Maisels WCS CITES regulations do not cover what is one of the largest and most important issues - meat trade within any given country. CITES only applies to cross-border transport of wildlife (or parts).

James Wingard Also true, but we should also be mindful that corruption is also made substantially easier in legal systems that are weak to begin with.

KarenFriendsofBonobos Yes, attitudes are changing. We are trying to accelerate this change!

Boo Maisels WCS Within any given nation, national law is what is applied, and as Annette says in all range states great apes are integrally protected (no hunting, capture, etc.)

Olga I do think more campaigns on changing and assessing perceptions from people is needed.

Boo Maisels WCS In Central Africa, and logging concession with FSC certified management is obliged to uphold national law, which includes wildlife law.

Ronald Orenstein The problem is not what laws are in existence but the extent to which they are implemented and enforced.

Kenneth@Bonobo Aid Have we considered channeling funds into "commercial" ad campaigns to change the cultural acceptability of apes as pets? Perhaps a shocking targeted campaign in the markets that fuel ape exploitation and trafficking could be effective. Social media seems to say it's "cool" to have an ape as a pet- but a campaign may change that.

Tyler Winarski Have there been efforts to create a sort of ecotourism centered around Orangutans in Indonesia? The ecotourism implemented around the Mountain Gorillas in Central Africa has seemed to be a huge proponent at protecting the wild mountain gorillas.

Jody Cole Does Arcus have a relationship with Wild Aid regarding publicity on a large scale to inform the public of what is happening?

Kenneth@Bonobo Aid And agree- loss of habitat is a massive problem... Apes that were once hidden and inaccessible, are now in the open for the taking and exploitation.

Ronald Orenstein Demand reduction campaigns need to be specifically keyed to the target markets. What might convince you not to buy an ape might not convince a person in an end market country.

Annette Tyler: Yes, there have been efforts to create ecotourism to orang-utans. However, they are very different from mountain gorillas. They tend to be solitary and high up in the trees. So the "experience" is very different. However...it is no less exciting and wonderful.

Ronald Orenstein WildAid runs excellent PSA campaigns in China and elsewhere.

1planet Great question Tyler! I was going to ask if the ecotourism in central africa - trekking for mountain gorillas - have actually been helpful in conserving them?

Boo Maisels WCS Ronald, yep, someone wanting to pay school fees for their child won't be swayed by social media.

John at the Cross Cultural Foundation of Uganda. Happy to listen... answering to 1 planet: definitely!

Ana Paula @ Save the Chimps Complex issues require complex solutions. We need a shift of paradigm. We, as a species, need to start respecting the boundaries of our planet, of nature - and not make all decisions based on business interests.

Alison at Arcus @Jody: there is a WildAid case study in this volume of State of the Apes.

Ian Redmond There's a good example of a Cameroonian football star urging people not to eat apes and other endangered species here: <https://4apes.com/working-groups/bushm...>

Annette @1planet: yes, I believe mountain gorilla tourism has been vital in ensuring their protection. They are more "valuable" from a financial perspective, when alive than when dead. So, there is huge incentive to protect them and they have been protected very effectively. However, as I said earlier, tourism is also dangerous. It can introduce diseases.

Boo Maisels WCS @1planet: if there has been no mountain gorilla tourism, much of their habitat would long ago have been turned into agriculture.

Ronald Orenstein In Malaysian Borneo most orangutan tourism is directed to rehabilitation centres such as Semenggoh in Sarawak or Sepilok in Sabah - as noted, seeing truly wild orangutans is very difficult, and one major population centre (Lanjak Entimau in Sarawak) is not open to tourists.

Jody Cole @Alison Thank you. WildAid is a giant in the work just like Arcus. Glad there is partnering here.

1planet @Boo @Annette - good points!

Kenneth@Bonobo Aid Thank you Ian. Will check that out... I think we need something similar in China / other areas in Asia as well- areas that fuel this trade and these myths about animal parts and their fictitious health benefits.

Carol Also in Indonesia Borneo, a focus of orangutan tourism is directed to rehabilitation centres.

Ben Amon Do you believe integration of conservation science in the curriculum of juniors at the initial stages of the education system can go a long way to change the status quo in the long term?

Ronald Orenstein Many years ago Amy Vedder and Bill Weber, who were conducting an education campaign in Rwanda, told me that the commonest question they were asked by villages was "Why would people come here to see gorillas? Why wouldn't they watch gorillas in their own country?"

Liana Chua Hi, just joined. Tyler: There are various ecotourism initiatives across Indonesia and Malaysia, but they vary a great deal - there are different funding/tourism models, various private/govt/NGO configurations, and varying degrees of local community involvement. So it depends on where you are.

Annette Ben: I do think that people in urban areas...often very far removed from experience of nature...need to learn, understand, appreciate and feel greater humility towards nature. Education is a vital part of any conservation effort. But education alone is not the problem...because some people know what the problems are but have no alternatives.

Dominic Travis There is an interesting footnote to the book Eating Apes, where I submitted a comment to the bushmeat crisis task force in 2001 and subsequently got run out of the community. This suggestion was that this is a conversation about optimizing the issues of conservation, trade, food security and FOOD SAFETY. I am not sure that we yet have the breadth of stakeholders needed in this conversation.

Liz Bennett Danum Valley in Sabah and Batang Ai in Sarawak are places where tourists can see wild orang-utans. High end, need patience, but can get great views.

Bonnie @ Thinking Animals United Getting the message out means going where people gather, whether it is via television, radio, local festivals, classrooms, workplaces, etc.

Ronald Orenstein Further to Annette's comment - urban populations in range countries may be less familiar with their own wildlife than westerners who can visit zoos and watch nature documentaries.

Tyler Winarski Are there any websites with statistics relating to primate deaths and displacement? I am wondering how wildlife pet trade, poaching for meat, deforestation, disease, etc. all individually impact primate population numbers.

Annette Dominic: I think the safety issues are vital, you are absolutely right, and needs to be much better integrated into the analysis of the problem as well as the development of solutions.

Ronald Orenstein Wild oranges can also be seen on the Kinabatangan River in Sabah.

Orangutan Veterinary Aid @Carol The majority of rehabilitation centres in Indonesian Borneo are closed to tourism and are charity run as opposed to government run centres such as Sepilok or Semengoh in Malaysian Borneo.

Annette Tyler: you may want to visit www.stateoftheapes.org to look at the four volumes there, as well as the GRASP website of the UNEP. There is a great deal of information provided there, although it is not always easy to disentangle all the threats.

Ronald Orenstein The commercial bushmeat trade can be seen as actually removing food sources from local communities.

Ben Amon Thank you Annette, I am an advocate for animal welfare in my community and truly over the years, I have realised that most people do not violate animal welfare because they are not compassionate but because they have no alternative indeed. Poverty is a big driver to most of the issues in my community (Uganda).

Hannah Buckley (2019) describes *P. pygmaeus* as a species dependent on ecotourism for survival, where population viability assessments (PVA) project low levels of ecotourism will result in a decline of the species, moderate levels will keep the population stable and high levels of ecotourism will increase population numbers.

Annette Ben: I do agree with you completely. For so many people, they would love to live in greater harmony with nature and appreciate wildlife, but it isn't always easy when you have few alternatives.

Ian Redmond Thanks Annette - for those unfamiliar with it the GRASP website is <https://www.un-grasp.org/>

Boo Maisels WCS We need to remember that the vast majority of meat sold is within -country, or across a river border such as between Brazzaville and Kinshasa.

Boo Maisels WCS Tiny amounts are sent to France, etc for the diaspora.

International Community Fansfornature @Orang-Utan Veterinary Aid You are right. We know it. it's hard.

Alison at Arcus @Tyler: collating such statistics is incredibly difficult, particularly as these activities are often interlinked. The authors and contributors for this volume of State of the Apes have tried to provide some of the statistics, and obviously the reference list also provides a wealth of additional publications to refer to.

Ronald Orenstein What is the citation for the Buckley paper?

Boo Maisels WCS But thousands of animals are eaten inside DRC, Congo, Gabon, Cameroon

Hannah Buckley, R. (2019). Wild animals and tourists. In G. Hosey & V. Melfi (Eds.), Anthrozoology: human-animal interactions in domesticated and wild animals (pp. 104 – 119). Oxford University Press. DOI: 10.1093/oso/9780198753629.003.0006

Dominic Travis Annette, thanks for that - there is great interest now at FAO in discussing food safety in informal markets - I believe we can work with them to look at risk in value chains - and all food safety risk assessments of bushmeat value chains show that most risk occurs and accrues at the source. Thus, managing the source can create win-win solutions for conservation and ZEID spillover risk. COVID has sparked this discussion obviously but it was centered around NHPs just a couple years ago with Ebola, etc.

Tyler Winarski Okay good to know, I'm an undergrad biological anthropology student and right now I'm trying to acquire as much knowledge as I can on this subject. Thank you.

Boo Maisels WCS Demand change of urban consumers is key. Robert Mwinyihali leads a hugely important campaign in Kinshasa and Brazzaville to do just that.

Ronald Orenstein In the DRC there is widespread trade in monkeys as well as apes; there have been seizures of illegally-exported DRC monkeys in Zimbabwe.

Carol @OrangutanVeterinaryAid I was thinking of Camp Leakey at Tanjung Puting NP

Tyler Winarski Are researchers able to study grauer's gorillas in the wild? Last I read it was quite difficult due to the political climate of the region.

Boo Maisels WCS An excellent pan-continental sustainable wildlife programme is here: <https://www.swm-programme.info/>

International Community Fansfornature @Carol I was thinking Samboja Lestari and Sintang Orangutan Center ;-)

Allard Blom - WWF That part of eastern DRC is indeed still unstable and studying gorillas there is very challenging

Boo Maisels WCS This combines WCS, CIRAD, CIFOR and FAO. Of course, great apes are entirely "off the menu"

Tyler Winarski @Allard Blom that's unfortunate

Ian Redmond Thanks Boo - that SWM website is very useful!

Charles Jones Nsonkali Good to stop logging companies to stop destroying the habitat of apes around Lobeke Boumba Bek National Park in Cameroon

Allard Blom - WWF We are still operating in Itombwe

Boo Maisels WCS In Kahuzi Biega, WCS has a permanent field presence, looking at Grauer's gorillas, and a recent publication on their abundance across their range. <https://journals.plos.org/plosone/arti...>

Ronald Orenstein Dealing with the commercial/international trade is a different matter from trying to influence local actions - the two need to be kept separate, especially when people accuse supporters of actions against commercial trade of ignoring local food security issues. The two are separate and often antithetical.

Tyler Winarski What about the Cross River Gorilla? I've read their numbers are as low as 300 individuals? Are there measures in place to help study and conserve them? I rarely hear much about news relating to them.

Allard Blom - WWF WCS is active in there

Hannah Have you read Gorillas in the Mist by Dian Fossey? You might like it!

Boo Maisels WCS Robert is talking about one of the SWM sites.

Donny Moss Do all of the countries in West Africa and Central Africa that have wild great apes (but no eco-tourism) have conservation group(s) working to protect them?

Tyler Winarski @Boo Maisels WCS thank you

Boo Maisels WCS Okapi Faunal Reserve.

Boo Maisels WCS Donny- yes, pretty much

Annette Donny: Although Boo is right, pretty much there are conservation groups in most of them, but not necessarily covering all the range or active in all the different ways that are needed. Holistic approaches are needed and these do not exist in all sites.

Allard Blom - WWF There are also several tourism site with habituated western lowland gorillas.

Alison at Arcus Tyler: if you look at volume 3 of State of the Apes, which looks at Infrastructure Development, there is a case study about Cross River provided by WCS.

Victoria Gehrke As mentioned, one of the drivers is lack of affordable and access to health care, Health In Harmony has an amazing (and successful) approach in Indonesia where patients pay for treatment with seedlings which are then used for reforestation!

Tyler Winarski @Hannah Yes I am, her story with the Gorillas was a big inspiration for me to get involved in the field. I haven't finished though as I am also reading Primates and Philosophers by Frans De Waal at the same time haha.

Boo Maisels WCS Tyler: Cross River Gorilla, yes about 300 animals. The IUCN Red List has very recent publications on all ape species, and all entries include population estimates, threats, and

conservation actions necessary. Example: Cross River Gorilla

<https://www.iucnredlist.org/species/39998/102326240>

Ronald Orenstein There are also local NGOs trying to assist in anti-poaching efforts - eg the Eagle Network and the Last Great Ape Association

Tyler Winarski Thank you everyone this information will be very useful.

Boo Maisels WCS IUCN also has the Section on Great Apes, lots of publications here: http://www.primatesg.org/great_apes/

Ian Redmond Some good guidance here with the hashtag #CruelNotCute - <https://4apes.com/news/item/1724-cruel...>

International Community Fansfornature absolutely right bravo

Angela at Arcus Arcus Instagram follower obestbelovedac comments: "Law isn't enough: it can enforce and set precedents for behaviors from the inside out, but there also requires an inner shift of awareness that supports the law from the interior of people. Eventually that makes the law redundant; without that, the law will continually be something certain people battle against and circumvent through illegal behaviors."

1planet celebrity photos with endangered animals is a HUGE problem! Celebrities have a responsibility to be a good example to the millions of people that "want to be like them"

Kenneth@Bonobo Aid Anthony Caere- flying for Virunga National Park to Lwiro Primates Sanctuary

Dominic Travis Sorry, has this new publication been highlighted here? <https://advances.sciencemag.org/conten...>

Hannah @Ian Redmond - this is a really good link! Thank you

Annette Dominic: thanks for sharing the article. It hadn't yet been shared, so thank you.

Ivonne Kienast @Ian: thanks for this information. It is always so difficult to make people understand the damage they are causing by sharing those kinds of images.

Kenneth@Bonobo Aid Anthony Caere has been a massive help to primate conservation and awareness IMO... His Instagram page has been a huge help in a positive way. Perhaps some may misinterpret this clip- but the good far outweighs the bad in this specific case.

Annette Ian: thank you for sharing that excellent and powerful resource

virg how does a video rescuing a chimp promote problems?

FS Exactly! Usually the conservation heroes are always western white people... while the locals are the poachers, the criminals, the ones not respecting the laws. Conservation needs to be decolonized and communications and media play an important role

Boo Maisels WCS Here is the IUCN statement on photos with primates: <https://humanprimateinteractions.wpcom...>

Sian Waters The IUCN Primate Specialist Group Section for Human-Primate Interactions has developed best practice guidelines for responsible images of NHPs aimed at people studying/caring

for primates. The guidelines are available in more than 20 languages off our website <https://humanprimateinteractions.wpc.com...>

Ronald Orenstein I think that is less true in Malaysia; certainly the staff etc at Semenggoh are Sarawakans.

@educate101 The video content of the anti-poaching pilot from Virunga National Park, Anthony Caere was a great example of human beings rescuing & protecting the chimp. He is loved locally and internationally for his work at Virunga. He transported the chimp to Lwiro Primate Conservation for rehabilitation.

Liana Chua FS: well said. Conventional conservation categories and the language of heroism and villainy need to be interrogated/decolonised too.

Donny Moss So complicated. The sanctuaries must feel the need to show the human surrogate mothers caring for orphans in order to raise money to pay the caregivers. Those images must bring in much needed donations. Disclaimers are vital.

KarenFriendsofBonobos @Donny well said.

Lisa Education is the key.

Ian Redmond Sian is right, context is everything.

Annette What is vital is the provision of contextual information that explains what is happening, what is wrong with the situation and how it should change. Sanctuaries and people who are for apes are in an impossible situation sometimes.

Valentina Stackl Absolutely! It's very complex, and often these memes and viral videos are boiled down to very simple terms/narrative tropes.

Sian Waters @Donny Moss - the context of such photos is vital and can be lost when such photos go viral thus losing the educational message.

Ronald Orenstein Not every sanctuary does this. At Semenggoh what visitors see are orangutans that now live in the surrounding forest coming to feeding platforms - I have never seen anyone carrying an orangutan there (multiple visits - my wife's office was next door!)

FS Costa Rica launched a massive campaign to stop animal selfies among tourists... perhaps worth taking a look

Ronald Orenstein Here is a link to a white paper on wildlife markets and COVID I prepared last year for Humane Society International (with many references): <https://www.hsi.org/wp-content/uploads...>

Marli Would you say the harm of images outweigh the positives? For instance, I am an anthropology student (older) and there have been many sanctuaries I have only come to know of because of social media and videos such as the Lwiro primate flight. How is this balanced?

Thomas Gillespie More on this complex interplay here: <https://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10...>

Hannah @Ronald Orenstein... Sepilok Orangutan Rehabilitation Centre is very similar - but you always get that one tourist that takes advantage of a photo op. Fab link to HSI white paper - I attended a HSI webinar not long ago about animals in the pandemic - it was great.

Alison at Arcus @FS yes, the #stopanimalselfies campaign is referred to in this volume.

Sian Waters @Marli. We explain the drawbacks very clearly in our guidelines <https://humanprimateinteractions.wpc.com...>

Ivonne Kienast @Tom: very interesting article. Thanks.

Annette Marli: Given that the selfie images is driving a significant market and trade in apes....babies....it is definitely very harmful. However, as you say, the images can also be extremely helpful when provided with context and presented in a thoughtful manner. It needs to change, it needs to become stronger and more effective to achieve conservation and welfare impact.

Dominic Travis NHP in entertainment - research shows this effects perception of threatened status: <https://phys.org/news/2015-02-percepti...>

Mark Harrison We also provide discussion of ZEID-related issues in tropical peatlands (an important ape habitat in both Indonesia and W. Africa) here: <https://peerj.com/articles/10283/>

Liana Chua @Marli: it's a really tough balance for rehabilitation centres and their partners cuz social media is a very powerful way of raising awareness and funds. Some orgs are having ongoing discussions about how best to strike a balance, so they're not completely unaware of these problems.

Valentina Stackl @Marli The images and the stories we tell should be aligned with the world we want to see--so absolutely sanctuaries can and should have a robust social media presence. It's just about how and what can be shared. The goal would be that the culture around this shifts, and that animal and human images are only shared when they adhere to certain guidelines (which folks in this chat have already shared).

Jody Cole This presentation is mindblowing.

KarenFriendsofBonobos The sanctuaries are very aware of these issues.

Thomas Gillespie Updates from our IUCN Primate Specialists Group COVID Task Force here: <http://www.primate-sg.org/covid-19>

Ian Redmond For a discussion on the impact of Covid-19 early in the pandemic, see <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=5xadPU...>

Marli Thank you so much for your responses

Dirck Please find latest guidance on great apes and COVID-19 from the IUCN's Primate Specialist Group's Section on Great Apes here: <http://www.primate-sg.org/covid-19>

Ronald Orenstein Please understand that the term 'wet market' in Asia covers a wide range of markets that do not sell wildlife, and the term in this context may be culturally insensitive to people

who visit wet markets to buy (say) vegetables. I prefer to say 'wildlife markets' in this context (or at least 'wet markets selling wildlife', if you must).

Jody Cole Thank you everyone for your engagement here. I am a safari guide and tour operator to Africa. I love having this info to help my guests be more informed. Truly, Thank you.

Tyler Winarski Has hunting apes for meat only been a recent phenomenon? Say in the last 100- 200 years?

Tyler Winarski Or can we not say definitively?

Ronald Orenstein The commercial bushmeat trade to major urban centres is certainly recent. Subsistence hunting is probably as old as human hunting is.

Tyler Winarski Thanks Ronald, that makes sense.

Boo Maisels WCS Tyler, people have been hunting apes and all other species since we evolved. The arrival of guns and wire snares has changed the effectiveness of that hunting.

Allard Blom - WWF Thanks Boo: snares are particularly problematic as they are very effective at low cost and catch anything, including apes.

Ronald Orenstein A good non-ape example is the spread of chytridiomycosis through the pet trade in amphibians to native frog populations - not a zoonosis per se but a cross-species infection caused by the wildlife trade.

Boo Maisels WCS Covid-19 has shown how rapidly social behaviour can change in a few days if people are scared enough.

International Community Fansformance It is also, almost always, a question of tradition. That doesn't make it any easier. As long as Europeans or whoever is shooting in the western world it is difficult to tell them: You are not allowed. :-(

Steve U @Ronald - African Swine Fever is another one.

Ronald Orenstein Yes, thanks also to Arcus for its very useful books on this issue - and thanks for making them free to download.

FS Agree with Ronald on the use of the term "wet market"... it may reinforce stereotypes so we've been avoiding that... even wildlife markets can sometimes be problematic because these markets are basic public markets where people get fresh food... that can include not only wild animals, but also domesticated ones, as well as fruits and vegetables, and many other goods. There is also usually the cultural elements playing... such as music, dance, festivals, etc. It would feel very weird that if all of a sudden, people would start campaigning to ban Brazilian "feiras"... which are basically itinerant public markets that take place once or twice a week in local neighborhoods. Just an example.

Ronald Orenstein We should also bear in mind that in many countries local conservationists run serious personal risks that outsiders may not face - their bravery needs to be recognized.

Lisa My understanding is that the term "wet market" refers to any market whose floors are constantly hosed down due to animal blood etc. Is that correct?

Boo Maisels WCS In Eastern DRC the villagers were bumping elbows rather than shaking hands to avoid Ebola. People can change behaviour fast and effectively. That was before Covid-19, so probably these Ebola-avoidance behaviours have -to some point- reduced Covid transmission.

Donny Moss NYC has over 70 live animal markets, many of which sell multiple species of animals intensively confined in filthy settings. These markets were deemed "essential businesses" when the city shut down.

Alison at Arcus @Ronald and @FS we will be sure to keep the correct terminology in mind when copy editing the 5th volume. Thank you.

Ronald Orenstein In Malaysia it is simply a place to buy produce (as opposed to a dry market).

Dominic Travis overview of disease and wl trade here from pre covid days:

<https://doc.oie.int/dyn/portal/index.seam?page=alo&alold=31221>

Kasia Thank you for this wonderful discussion! Looking forward to the link to the webinar!

Boo Maisels WCS Super webinar, thanks all.

Ian Redmond Excellent panellists and discussion - thank you Arcus!